

Credit Discrimination

Contents

CD-Rom Contents	xxv
---------------------------	-----

Chapter 1

Introduction and First Considerations

1.1 Credit Discrimination Laws—A Powerful Answer to a Pervasive Problem	1
1.1.1 Credit Discrimination Is a Widespread Problem	1
1.1.2 Credit Discrimination and Other Discrimination Statutes Provide Far-Reaching Remedies.	2
1.1.3 Growth in the Utilization of Credit Discrimination Laws	2
1.1.4 Effective Uses of Credit Discrimination Statutes	3
1.2 How to Use This Manual.	5
1.2.1 Abbreviations	5
1.2.2 Overview of Chapters.	5
1.2.3 Violation of the General Prohibition Against Discrimination Versus Violation of Specific ECOA Rules	5
1.2.4 This Manual Analyzes Several Different Statutes	6
1.2.5 Source Materials Found in This Manual	6
1.3 The ECOA	7
1.3.1 Overview	7
1.3.2 History.	8
1.3.2.1 1974 ECOA Version Targeted Sex and Marital Status Discrimination	8
1.3.2.2 1976 Amendments Broaden ECOA’s Scope.	8
1.3.2.3 1985 Revision of Regulation B and Issuance of FRB Commentary.	9
1.3.2.4 Women’s Business Ownership Act of 1988	9
1.3.2.5 1991 Amendments.	9
1.3.2.6 1996 Amendments.	9
1.3.2.7 2003 Revision of Regulation B and Official Staff Commentary	9
1.3.3 Sources of ECOA Precedent and Authority	9
1.3.3.1 The Statute, Regulation, and Commentary.	9
1.3.3.2 Legislative History	10
1.3.3.3 Other Sources of Authority	10
1.3.3.4 The ECOA Should Be Liberally Construed	10
1.4 The Fair Housing Act	11
1.4.1 Overview	11
1.4.2 History.	12
1.5 The Federal Civil Rights Acts: Sections 1981 and 1982	12
1.6 The Americans with Disabilities Act	13
1.7 State Credit Discrimination Laws	13
1.8 State UDAP Statutes	13
1.9 The Community Reinvestment Act (CRA)	14

Credit Discrimination

1.10 Other Sources of Precedent 14
 1.10.1 Housing Law in the Non-Credit Discrimination Context 14
 1.10.2 Employment Discrimination Law 15

Chapter 2

Scope

2.1 Introduction 17
2.2 Scope of the ECOA 17
 2.2.1 Introduction 17
 2.2.2 The ECOA Applies to “Credit” Transactions 17
 2.2.2.1 Definition of Credit 17
 2.2.2.1.1 General 17
 2.2.2.1.2 Is “debt” required to meet the ECOA definition of
 credit? 18
 2.2.2.2 Do Leases Involve Credit? 18
 2.2.2.2.1 Overview 18
 2.2.2.2.2 Disguised credit sales 18
 2.2.2.2.3 Personal property leases covered by the Consumer
 Leasing Act 19
 2.2.2.2.4 Residential leases 19
 2.2.2.2.5 Rent-to-own and other terminable leases 20
 2.2.2.3 Utility Service 21
 2.2.2.4 Check-Cashing and ATM Cards 21
 2.2.2.5 “Pay as You Go” Is Not Credit 21
 2.2.2.6 Medical Treatment 22
 2.2.2.7 ECOA Coverage by Agreement of the Parties 22
 2.2.3 The ECOA Applies to All Stages of a Credit Transaction 22
 2.2.4 The ECOA Prohibits Discrimination Against “Applicants” 23
 2.2.4.1 Definition of Applicant 23
 2.2.4.2 Guarantors, Sureties, and Similar Parties 23
 2.2.4.3 Applicant Need Not Make an Application 24
 2.2.4.4 Applicant Need Not Be Seeking Credit 25
 2.2.5 Creditors and Related Parties Subject to the ECOA 25
 2.2.5.1 General 25
 2.2.5.2 “Regularly” Extends, Renews, or Continues Credit 26
 2.2.5.3 Arrangers of Credit 26
 2.2.5.4 Participants in the Credit Decision, Including Assignees 28
 2.2.5.5 Exclusions from Definition of Creditor 29
 2.2.5.6 The Government as Creditor 29
 2.2.6 Transactions Partially Exempted from the ECOA 30
 2.2.6.1 General 30
 2.2.6.2 Public Utility Credit 31
 2.2.6.3 Incidental Consumer Credit 32
 2.2.6.3.1 Definition of incidental consumer credit 32
 2.2.6.3.2 Exemption is limited to only certain Regulation B
 provisions 32
 2.2.6.4 Business Credit 33
 2.2.6.5 Securities Credit 33
 2.2.6.6 Credit Extended to the Government 33
2.3 Scope of the Fair Housing Act 34
 2.3.1 Overview 34
 2.3.2 Residential Real-Estate-Related Transactions: Scope of § 3605 34
 2.3.2.1 General 34
 2.3.2.2 Transactions Covered by § 3605 34

Contents

2.3.2.2.1 Loans and other financial assistance used to buy, improve, repair, or maintain a dwelling 34

2.3.2.2.2 Home equity and other loans taking home as collateral 35

2.3.2.3 Credit Actors Covered by § 3605. 35

2.3.2.3.1 General 35

2.3.2.3.2 “Makers” of loans. 36

2.3.2.3.3 Purchasers of loans 36

2.3.2.3.4 Sellers, brokers, and appraisers. 37

2.3.3 Scope of § 3604. 37

2.3.3.1 Transactions Covered Under § 3604 37

2.3.3.1.1 General 37

2.3.3.1.2 Does § 3604 apply to home equity loans? 38

2.3.3.1.3 Implications of the § 3604 versus § 3605 debate 39

2.3.3.2 Credit Actors Covered by § 3604. 39

2.3.4 Interference, Coercion, Intimidation, or Threats: Scope of § 3617 39

2.3.5 Only Aggrieved Persons May Bring Actions. 40

2.4 Scope of Federal Civil Rights Acts 41

2.5 Scope of State Credit Discrimination Statutes 41

2.6 Scope of State UDAP Statutes 41

2.7 Summary of Key ECOA and FHA Provisions 42

Chapter 3

Prohibited Bases for Discrimination

3.1 Introduction 43

3.2 When Is Discrimination on a Prohibited Basis? 43

3.3 Prohibited Bases Under Both the ECOA and the FHA 44

3.3.1 Race and Color 44

3.3.2 Religion, Creed, Political Affiliation 44

3.3.3 National Origin 45

3.3.3.1 General 45

3.3.3.2 Country of Birth or Ancestry 45

3.3.3.3 English Language Ability 45

3.3.3.4 Immigration Status 46

3.3.3.4.1 Discrimination Against Immigrants 46

3.3.3.4.2 The ECOA standard 46

3.3.3.4.3 The Fair Housing Act standard 47

3.3.4 Sex or Gender 47

3.3.4.1 General 47

3.3.4.2 Special ECOA Protections 47

3.3.4.3 Sexual Orientation 48

3.4 Prohibited Bases Under the ECOA But Not the FHA 48

3.4.1 Marital Status 48

3.4.2 Age 49

3.4.3 Public Assistance Status 50

3.4.4 Good Faith Exercise of Consumer Credit Protection Act, Other Legal Rights 50

3.4.4.1 General 50

3.4.4.2 Exercise of Rights Under the Federal Consumer Credit Protection Act or a Substituted State Statute 51

3.4.4.3 Good Faith Exercise of Rights 52

3.4.4.4 Applicant Must Exercise the Rights 52

3.5 Prohibited Bases Under the FHA 52

3.5.1 Familial Status 52

3.5.2 Disability or Handicap 53

3.5.2.1 General 53

Credit Discrimination

3.5.2.2	Definition of “Handicap” or “Disability”	53
3.5.2.3	Application of the Americans with Disabilities Act to Credit Transactions	54
3.5.2.4	Reasonable Accommodation	54
3.6	Prohibited Bases Under the Federal Civil Rights Acts	55
3.6.1	Race and Color	55
3.6.2	National Origin	56
3.6.3	Immigration Status	56
3.7	Prohibited Bases Under State Credit Discrimination Laws: Sexual Orientation	57
3.8	Other Prohibited Bases	57
3.8.1	General	57
3.8.2	Discrimination and the Digital Divide	58
3.9	ECOA Prohibited Bases Do Not Apply to Special Purpose Credit Programs	59
3.9.1	General	59
3.9.2	Qualifying as a Special Purpose Credit Program	60
3.9.3	Special Purpose Credit Program Must Still Comply with Most ECOA Requirements	61
3.10	Protected Characteristics May Apply to Those Associated with Applicant	61
3.10.1	The General Rule	61
3.10.2	Does the ECOA’s Associational Protection Rule Apply to Public Assistance and to the Exercise of Rights Under the CCPA?	62

Chapter 4

Proving Credit Discrimination

4.1	Introduction	63
4.2	Proving Disparate Treatment	63
4.2.1	Introduction	63
4.2.2	Direct Evidence of Disparate Treatment	64
4.2.3	Circumstantial Evidence	65
4.2.3.1	The <i>McDonnell-Douglas</i> Burden Shifting Analysis	65
4.2.3.2	Is the <i>McDonnell-Douglas</i> Test Applicable in Credit Discrimination Cases?	65
4.2.3.3	The <i>McDonnell-Douglas</i> Standard in Predatory Lending/Reverse Redlining Cases	67
4.3	Proving Disparate Impact	67
4.3.1	Introduction	67
4.3.2	Burdens of Proof	68
4.3.2.1	General	68
4.3.2.2	ECOA Burden of Proof	69
4.3.2.3	FHA Burden of Proof	69
4.3.2.4	<i>Prima Facie</i> Case for ECOA and FHA Claims	70
4.3.2.4.1	Introduction	70
4.3.2.4.2	Identification of a specific policy	70
4.3.2.4.3	Disparate impact on a protected group	71
4.3.2.4.4	Causation	72
4.3.2.5	Business Justification	72
4.3.2.6	Are There Alternative Factors with Less Disparate Impact?	74
4.4	Sources of Evidence	75
4.4.1	The Consumer’s Own Records	75
4.4.2	The Creditor’s Own Files	75
4.4.3	Credit Reporting Agency Files	76
4.4.4	Testers	76
4.4.5	Home Mortgage Disclosure Act (HMDA) Data	78
4.4.5.1	General	78
4.4.5.2	Scope of HMDA	79

Contents

4.4.5.2.1 Covered Lenders 79
4.4.5.2.2 Required Data Collection 79
4.4.5.3 Access to HMDA Data. 81
4.4.5.4 Limits to HMDA Data 81
4.4.6 Other Sources of Mortgage Data. 82
4.4.6.1 General 82
4.4.6.2 Government-Sponsored Enterprise (Freddie Mac and Fannie Mae)
Data 82
4.4.7 Monitoring Data Required by the ECOA 83
4.4.8 Non-Mortgage Data 83

Chapter 5

Discrimination in Pre-Application and Application Procedures

5.1 Introduction 85
5.1.1 The Special ECOA Requirements 85
5.1.2 Discussion of the Stages of a Credit Transaction in This Manual 85
5.2 General Rule Against Discrimination 85
5.2.1 Introduction. 85
5.2.2 What Is “Discrimination” Under the General Rule? 85
5.2.3 The General Rule Applies to All Aspects of a Credit Transaction 86
5.3 Discrimination in the Pre-Application Stage of a Credit Transaction 86
5.3.1 Overview 86
5.3.2 Marketing Discrimination 87
5.3.2.1 The ECOA Standard 87
5.3.2.2 The Fair Housing Act Standard 88
5.3.2.3 Other Guidance 88
5.3.2.4 Marketing Discrimination as a Force in Predatory Lending 89
5.3.2.5 How Discrimination in Marketing Happens 89
5.3.2.6 Market Segmentation and Pre-Screened Marketing 90
5.3.3 Discrimination in Treatment of Potential Applicants 91
5.3.3.1 Steering 91
5.3.3.2 Testing 92
5.4 Application Procedures 93
5.4.1 General 93
5.4.2 Oral Applications for Credit 93
5.4.2.1 General 93
5.4.2.2 The Home Mortgage Exception 94
5.4.3 Providing Disparate Levels of Assistance in the Application Process 94
5.4.4 Requesting More Information About Applicants from Protected Groups 95
5.5 Prohibited Requests for Information 95
5.5.1 General Considerations 95
5.5.1.1 Introductions 95
5.5.1.2 ECOA Restricts Creditor from “Requesting” Information About
an “Applicant” 95
5.5.1.3 Information Legally Obtained Sometimes May Not Be Utilized
by Creditor 96
5.5.1.4 Should Regulation B Permit or Require Creditors to Request
Information About Prohibited Bases? 96
5.5.2 Types of Information That Creditors Can Not Seek 97
5.5.2.1 Race, Color, Religion, and National Origin 97
5.5.2.2 Sex; Optional Use of Courtesy Titles 97
5.5.2.2.1 Inquiries about applicant’s gender 97
5.5.2.2.2 Courtesy titles 98
5.5.2.2.3 Birth control, childbearing, or rearing 98
5.5.2.3 Marital Status 98

Credit Discrimination

- 5.5.2.3.1 When marital status information may be requested 98
- 5.5.2.3.2 Types of marital status information which may be requested 99
- 5.5.2.3.3 Creditors may also seek information that indirectly discloses marital status 99
- 5.5.2.4 Information About Spouse or Former Spouse. 99
- 5.5.2.5 Public Assistance Status 101
- 5.5.3 Exceptions to Restrictions on Requested Information 101
 - 5.5.3.1 The Home Mortgage Monitoring Requirements 101
 - 5.5.3.2 Coverage of the Home Mortgage Monitoring Requirements 102
 - 5.5.3.3 Information Required by Any Other Federal or State Statute or by Court Order for Monitoring Purposes 102
 - 5.5.3.4 Special Purpose Credit Programs 103
 - 5.5.3.5 Self-Test Exception 103
- 5.6 Co-Signature of Spouse or Other Person. 104
 - 5.6.1 General. 104
 - 5.6.2 Individual Credit When No Joint Property Is Involved 105
 - 5.6.3 Reliance on Jointly Owned Property to Establish Creditworthiness. 106
 - 5.6.4 Reliance on Community Property to Establish Creditworthiness. 107
 - 5.6.5 Individual Credit When Jointly Owned Property Is Taken As Security . . . 107
 - 5.6.6 When Do Applicants Voluntarily Enter into a Joint Account? 108
 - 5.6.7 Authorized Users 109
 - 5.6.8 Signature of Guarantor’s Spouse 109
- 5.7 Designation of Name on Account 110
- 5.8 Collateral, Security Deposits, Sureties, Other Forms of Creditor Protection 110
 - 5.8.1 Discriminatory Practices 110
 - 5.8.2 Injury Caused by Such Discrimination 111

Chapter 6

Discrimination in Credit Evaluation

- 6.1 Introduction 113
- 6.2 Credit Evaluation Practices That Violate the General Rule Against Discrimination 113
 - 6.2.1 The ECOA and FHA Standards 113
 - 6.2.2 Examples of Credit Evaluation Practices That Violate the General Rule . . 113
 - 6.2.2.1 Applying Different Standards on a Prohibited Basis 113
 - 6.2.2.2 Using Different Investigation Procedures on a Prohibited Basis . . . 114
 - 6.2.2.3 Appraisal Practices That Violate the General Rule Against Discrimination 114
 - 6.2.2.4 Failure to Combine Joint Applicant Income on the Basis of Marital Status 115
 - 6.2.2.5 Requirements for Immediate Payment 115
 - 6.2.2.6 Discrimination in Credit Limits 115
 - 6.2.2.7 Denial of Credit for Exercise of Rights Under the Consumer Credit Protection Act 116
- 6.3 Understanding Credit Evaluation Systems 116
 - 6.3.1 Introduction to the Three Types of Credit Evaluation Systems 116
 - 6.3.2 Credit Scoring Systems 116
 - 6.3.2.1 Description of Credit Scoring 116
 - 6.3.2.2 Regulation B Definition of Credit Scoring 117
 - 6.3.3 Judgmental Systems 118
 - 6.3.4 Combination Systems 118
 - 6.3.5 Different Requirements for Credit Scoring and Judgmental Systems 118
- 6.4 Discrimination Issues Raised by Credit Scoring 118

Contents

6.4.1	Data Indicating That Minority and Other Protected Groups Are Disadvantaged by Credit Scoring	118
6.4.2	Factors in a Credit Scoring System May Disfavor Minorities and Other Protected Groups	119
6.4.2.1	Overview	119
6.4.2.2	Discrimination’s Legacy	119
6.4.2.3	Under Representation in Scoring Model Development	120
6.4.2.4	Other Factors That May Disfavor Protected Classes	120
6.4.2.5	Industry’s Response	121
6.4.3	The Disparate Impact Analysis for Credit Scoring	121
6.4.4	Disparate Impact Litigation Challenging Credit Scoring	121
6.4.5	Discriminatory Uses of Credit Scoring	122
6.4.5.1	Overview	122
6.4.5.2	Discriminatory Score Thresholds	122
6.4.5.3	Overrides	122
6.4.5.4	“Coaching”	122
6.4.5.5	Credit Tier Markups and Supranatural Pricing	123
6.4.5.6	Use of Different Systems or Scoring Models for Different Populations	123
6.4.6	Credit Scores and Insurance	123
6.4.6.1	Use of Insurance Credit Scores	123
6.4.6.2	Do Insurance Credit Scores Discriminate?	124
6.5	Special ECOA Rules Concerning Credit Evaluation	125
6.5.1	Introduction	125
6.5.2	Income Sources	125
6.5.2.1	General	125
6.5.2.2	Appropriate Methods to Evaluate Protected Income.	125
6.5.2.3	Individual Evaluation of Protected Income.	125
6.5.2.4	Income from Multiple Sources.	125
6.5.2.5	Income Sources Associated with Older Applicants	126
6.5.2.6	Income Sources Associated with Women Applicants	126
6.5.2.7	Income Sources Associated with Public Assistance Recipients	127
6.5.3	Spousal Credit History	127
6.5.3.1	Background	127
6.5.3.2	Supplementing a Minimal Credit History.	127
6.5.3.3	Avoiding a Spouse’s Bad Credit History	128
6.5.4	Telephone Listing	128
6.5.5	Likelihood of Bearing or Rearing Children.	129
6.5.6	Availability of Credit Insurance	129
6.6	Allowable Discrimination on a Prohibited Basis.	129
6.6.1	Introduction	129
6.6.2	Age	129
6.6.2.1	Introduction	129
6.6.2.2	General Exceptions to the Prohibition Against Age Discrimination.	129
6.6.2.3	Relationship to State Laws	130
6.6.2.4	Age Discrimination Rules Applying Only to Credit Scoring Systems	130
6.6.2.5	Age Discrimination Rules Applying Only to Judgmental Systems	130
6.6.2.6	Combination Systems.	131
6.6.3	Public Assistance Status	132
6.6.3.1	General Rule Against Evaluations Based on Public Assistance Status.	132
6.6.3.2	Exception for Judgmental System.	132
6.6.4	Marital Status	133

Chapter 7

Redlining

7.1 Introduction and History of Redlining 135

7.2 Legal Claims Available to Challenge Redlining 135

 7.2.1 The ECOA, FHA, and Federal Civil Rights Acts 135

 7.2.2 Government Enforcement Actions 136

 7.2.3 Other Federal and State Statutes 137

7.3 Insurance Redlining 138

 7.3.1 General 138

 7.3.2 The Impact of Insurance Redlining 139

 7.3.3 Detecting Insurance Redlining 139

 7.3.4 Legal Claims Available to Challenge Insurance Redlining 140

 7.3.4.1 The Equal Credit Opportunity Act 140

 7.3.4.2 The Fair Housing Act 140

 7.3.4.2.1 The FHA Applies to Insurance 140

 7.3.4.2.2 Preemption and the McCarran-Ferguson Act 141

 7.3.4.3 The Federal Civil Rights Acts 142

 7.3.4.4 State Laws 142

Chapter 8

Reverse Redlining to Price Gouging: Discrimination in Credit Terms and Pricing

8.1 Introduction 147

8.2 Subprime and Predatory Lending 147

 8.2.1 General 147

 8.2.2 Discriminatory Impact of Subprime and Predatory Lending 148

 8.2.3 The Rationale for Subprime Lending: Are the Higher Prices Charged Connected to Higher Risk? 149

8.3 Challenging Reverse Redlining Using Credit Discrimination Statutes 150

8.4 Discriminatory Credit Markup Policies 151

8.5 Discrimination in Pricing of Related Goods, Services 153

 8.5.1 Introduction 153

 8.5.2 Types of Price Discrimination 154

 8.5.3 Why Members of Protected Groups Often Pay More 154

 8.5.4 Legal Theories to Challenge Price Discrimination 155

Chapter 9

Discrimination Subsequent to the Granting of Credit

9.1 Introduction 157

9.2 Types of Discrimination Subsequent to the Granting of Credit 157

 9.2.1 Loan Servicing 157

 9.2.2 Compliance with Warranties, Other Post-Sale Service 157

 9.2.3 Changes in Account Status 157

 9.2.4 Treatment Upon Default 158

9.3 Collection Against Non-Obligated Spouse Under Necessaries, Family Expense Laws 159

9.4 Credit Reporting 159

 9.4.1 General; Scope of Requirement 159

 9.4.2 Requirements Concerning Reporting Information to Reporting Agencies . . 160

 9.4.2.1 Designation of Separate Accounts for Spouses 160

 9.4.2.2 Other Credit Reporting Violations 161

9.5 Creditor Actions Triggered By Borrower’s Increased Age or Change in Name or Marital Status 161

 9.5.1 Rules Limiting Creditor Actions 161

 9.5.2 Scope of the Rules Limiting Creditor Actions 162

Contents

9.5.2.1 Rules Apply Only to Open-End Accounts 162
9.5.2.2 Rules Protect Only Applicants Who Are Contractually Liable. 162
9.5.3 Status of Account During Reapplication. 162
9.5.4 When Creditor Can Request Updated Information from Account Holders . . . 162
9.6 Continuing Requirement of Co-signer on Credit Renewal 163

Chapter 10

ECOA Procedural Requirements

10.1 Introduction 165
10.2 Overview of ECOA Notice Requirements 165
10.3 Notification Requirement for Approved Applications. 166
10.4 Notification Requirement If Creditor Makes a Counteroffer 166
 10.4.1 Overview. 166
 10.4.2 Is a Counteroffer an Adverse Action?. 166
 10.4.3 Notice Requirements If Counteroffer Is Not an Adverse Action 167
 10.4.4 Written Application Requirement. 168
10.5 Notification Requirement for Adverse Actions 169
 10.5.1 Adverse actions Involving New Credit Accounts 169
 10.5.2 Adverse Actions Involving Existing Accounts 169
 10.5.3 Adverse Actions Involving Counteroffers 171
 10.5.4 Content of Adverse Action Notices 171
 10.5.4.1 General. 171
 10.5.4.2 The Reasons for Adverse Action 171
 10.5.4.2.1 Reasons must be specific 171
 10.5.4.2.2 Reasons must be the real ones 172
 10.5.4.2.3 Reasons that must be disclosed when a credit scoring
 system is used 173
 10.5.4.2.4 When creditor discloses only the applicant's right to a
 statement of reasons 174
10.6 General Notice Requirements 174
 10.6.1 Timing of Notices. 174
 10.6.2 Form of the Notification. 174
 10.6.2.1 General. 174
 10.6.2.2 Electronic Notifications. 175
 10.6.2.2.1 The interim rule 175
 10.6.2.2.2 Potential pitfalls of electronic notifications for
 consumers 176
 10.6.3 Who Must Receive Notice? 177
 10.6.3.1 Applicants. 177
 10.6.3.2 Notice to Multiple Applicants 177
 10.6.3.3 Is Actual Receipt Required?. 178
10.7 Additional Notice Requirements for New Accounts 178
 10.7.1 Application Required. 178
 10.7.2 Notice Requirements for Completed Applications. 179
 10.7.3 Notice Requirements for Incomplete Applications 179
 10.7.4 Withdrawn Applications for Credit 180
10.8 Who Must Comply with Notice Requirements? 180
 10.8.1 Credit Arrangers Are Not Required to Comply with Notice Provisions . . 180
 10.8.2 Notice By Multiple Creditors 181
10.9 Exceptions to Notice Requirements 182
 10.9.1 Incidental Consumer Credit 182
 10.9.2 Business Credit. 182
 10.9.2.1 General. 182
 10.9.2.2 Rules for Small Business Applicants. 183
 10.9.2.3 Rules for Other Business Applicants 183

Credit Discrimination

10.9.3 Creditor’s Inadvertent Error May Excuse Notice Violations 183

10.10 Relation of ECOA Notices to Fair Credit Reporting Act Adverse Action Notices. 183

10.11 Notification About Right to Receive Appraisal Report. 184

10.12 ECOA Record Retention Requirements 185

10.12.1 Preservation of Records 185

10.12.2 Preservation of Records in Case of an Investigation, Enforcement Proceeding, or Civil Action 186

10.12.3 Retention of Prohibited Information 186

10.12.4 Transactions Exempt from Record Retention Requirements 187

10.12.5 Inadvertent Error 187

Chapter 11

Litigating a Credit Discrimination Case

11.1 Introduction 189

11.2 Does the Plaintiff Have Standing? 189

11.2.1 General 189

11.2.2 Do Testers and Non-Profit Organizations Have Standing? 190

11.2.2.1 General. 190

11.2.2.2 FHA Standing for Testers 191

11.2.2.3 FHA Standing for Organizational Plaintiffs. 191

11.2.3 Associational Standing. 192

11.3 The Defendant—Who Is Liable? 192

11.3.1 Direct Creditor Liability. 192

11.3.2 Finding Deep Pockets: Extending Liability Beyond Direct Creditors 193

11.3.2.1 General. 193

11.3.2.2 Individual Liability. 193

11.4 Class Actions 194

11.5 Selecting the Forum. 196

11.5.1 Federal or State Court 196

11.5.1.1 Reasons to Choose One Forum or the Other. 196

11.5.1.2 Obtaining the Desired Forum. 196

11.5.2 Deciding Whether to Select an Administrative Determination in FHA Cases 198

11.5.2.1 Administrative Option May Be Pursued Simultaneously with Court Action 198

11.5.2.2 Reasons to Choose Administrative or Judicial Option 198

11.5.2.3 How the Administrative Procedure Works 199

11.5.3 Mandatory Arbitration 199

11.5.3.1 Introduction. 199

11.5.3.2 Has a Binding Arbitration Agreement Been Formed?. 200

11.5.3.3 Was the Arbitration Agreement Made Knowingly and Willingly?. 200

11.5.3.4 When Arbitration Conflicts with Statute’s Remedial Scheme. 200

11.5.3.4.1 General. 200

11.5.3.4.2 Limits on punitive damages 201

11.5.3.4.3 Limits on class actions 201

11.5.3.4.4 Injunctive relief 202

11.5.3.4.5 Limits on recovery of attorney fees and costs; high arbitration fees. 203

11.5.3.5 Does the ECOA Prohibit Arbitration of Claims Brought Under the Consumer Credit Protection Act?. 204

11.6 Selecting Causes of Action 204

11.6.1 Advantages of Various Claims. 204

11.6.1.1 General. 204

Contents

11.6.1.2	Remedy, Forum, and Defenses	205
11.6.1.3	State Laws Not Preempted.	205
11.6.2	What Causes of Action May Be Brought in the Same Lawsuit?	206
11.7	Private Remedies.	207
11.7.1	Overview.	207
11.7.2	Actual Damages	207
11.7.2.1	General.	207
11.7.2.2	Tangible Injury	207
11.7.2.3	Intangible Damages	208
11.7.3	Multiple and Minimum Statutory Damages	209
11.7.4	Punitive Damages	209
11.7.4.1	General.	209
11.7.4.2	Punitive Damages in FHA and Federal Civil Rights Cases	209
11.7.4.3	ECOA and Punitive Damages.	211
11.7.4.3.1	Punitive damages are mandatory under the ECOA	211
11.7.4.3.2	Limits on the size of ECOA punitive damage awards.	212
11.7.4.3.3	Amount of actual damages awarded as factor in determining size of punitive damages award	212
11.7.4.3.4	Frequency and persistence of creditor’s non-compliance as factor in determining size of punitive damages award.	212
11.7.4.3.5	Creditor’s resources as factor in determining size of punitive damages award.	213
11.7.4.3.6	Number of persons adversely affected as factor in determining size of punitive damages award	213
11.7.4.3.7	Extent to which creditor’s non-compliance was intentional as factor in determining size of punitive damages award.	213
11.7.4.3.8	Other relevant factors in determining size of punitive damages award.	214
11.7.5	Equitable and Declaratory Relief	214
11.7.5.1	Prospective Relief	214
11.7.5.2	Restitution and Disgorgement.	215
11.7.5.3	Voiding an Individual’s Obligation Under a Note or Security Agreement	216
11.7.6	Attorney Fees and Costs.	217
11.7.6.1	General Standards	217
11.7.6.2	When Is an Action Successful?	217
11.7.6.3	Fees for Legal Services, Pro Bono, and Pro Se Attorneys.	222
11.7.6.4	Calculating the Award.	222
11.7.6.5	Fee Applications	223
11.7.6.6	Costs and Witness Fees.	225
11.7.6.7	Appeals of Attorney Fee Awards	225
11.7.6.8	Interim Fees	225
11.7.6.9	Apportionment of Award Among Defendants	225
11.7.7	Election of Remedies.	225
11.8	Statute of Limitations.	226
11.8.1	Affirmative Actions	226
11.8.1.1	ECOA and FHA Claims	226
11.8.1.1.1	General rule: Two-year statute of limitations.	226
11.8.1.1.2	When the Statute Begins to Run	227
11.8.1.1.3	Extending the time period	228
11.8.1.2	Federal Civil Rights Act Claims	229
11.8.1.3	State Law Claims.	230
11.8.2	Defensive Claims	230

Credit Discrimination

11.9 Creditor Defenses 231
 11.9.1 General 231
 11.9.2 Business Justification Defense 231
 11.9.3 Special ECOA Defenses 232
 11.9.3.1 Good Faith Compliance 232
 11.9.3.2 The Inadvertent Error Defense 232
 11.9.3.3 Creditor’s Reasonable Notice of Violation 233
 11.9.3.4 Special Defenses by FDIC and RTC 233
 11.9.4 Defenses to Fair Housing Act and Civil Rights Acts Claims 233

Chapter 12

Government Enforcement

12.1 Introduction 235
12.2 Agencies Responsible For ECOA Enforcement 235
 12.2.1 The U.S. Attorney General 235
 12.2.2 Federal Trade Commission 235
 12.2.3 The Federal Reserve Board 235
 12.2.4 Other Federal Agencies 236
 12.2.5 Agency Enforcement Policies and Statements 236
12.3 Fair Housing Act Enforcement 237
 12.3.1 HUD Administrative Enforcement 237
 12.3.2 Civil Enforcement of the FHA by the United States Attorney General 238
12.4 Selected Government Enforcement Actions 239
 12.4.1 Enforcement by Justice Department 239
 12.4.1.1 Overview 239
 12.4.1.2 Discriminatory Marketing 239
 12.4.1.3 Redlining 239
 12.4.1.3.1 Lender Redlining 239
 12.4.1.3.2 Insurance Redlining 241
 12.4.1.4 Reverse Redlining 241
 12.4.1.5 Overages 242
 12.4.1.6 Differential Denial Rates 244
 12.4.1.7 Credit Scoring 245
 12.4.2 Federal Trade Commission Enforcement Actions 245
 12.4.3 Office of the Comptroller of the Currency 246
12.5 Enforcement Activities at the State and Local Levels 246

Appendix A

Federal Credit Discrimination Statutes

A.1 Equal Credit Opportunity Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 1691–1691f 249
A.2 Fair Housing Act, 42 U.S.C. §§ 3601–3631 255
A.3 Civil Rights Acts, 42 U.S.C. §§ 1981, 1982, 1988 270

Appendix B

Federal Reserve Board Regulation B (Equal Credit Opportunity) 271

Appendix C

Official Staff Commentary on Regulation B 303

Appendix D

HUD Fair Housing Act Regulations 321

Appendix E

Home Mortgage Disclosure Act and Regulation C

E.1 Home Mortgage Disclosure Act—12 U.S.C §§ 2801–2810 333
E.2 Home Mortgage Disclosure (Regulation C)—12 C.F.R. §§ 203.1–203.6 338

Contents

Appendix F	State Credit Discrimination Laws	343
Appendix G	Sample Pleadings	
	G.1 Sample Complaint Alleging Denial of Home Mortgage and Discriminatory Appraisal Practices as ECOA, Fair Housing, and Civil Rights Acts Violations	369
	G.2 Sample Complaint Alleging ECOA Co-Signer Violation	371
	G.3 Sample Class Action Complaint Alleging ECOA Cosigner Violation	372
	G.4 Sample Complaint Alleging Violations of ECOA Notice Provisions (As Well As Truth in Lending, Fair Credit Reporting Act, and Other Violations)	373
	G.5 Complaint Alleging Federal ECOA and State ECOA Notice Violations	378
	G.6 First Amended Complaint Alleging ECOA Notice Violations and Violations of the Federal Fair Credit Reporting Act	379
	G.7 Sample Complaint Alleging Discriminatory Mark-Up Practices Against Automobile Financer.	381
	G.8 Agreed Pre-Trial Order Including Jury Instructions in ECOA Notice Case	391
	G.9 Proposed Jury Instructions in ECOA Notice Case	395
Appendix H	Sample Discovery	
	H.1 Plaintiff’s Interrogatories and Request for Production of Documents in ECOA Notice Case	399
	H.2 Interrogatories for ECOA Co-Signer Violation	401
	H.3 Interrogatories for ECOA “Zip Code Redlining”	402
	H.4 Request for Production of Documents in Fair Housing Case.	403
Appendix I	Consumer’s Guide to Credit Discrimination Laws (Appropriate for Distribution to Clients)	
	I.1 Introduction	405
	I.2 Department of Housing and Urban Development, Fair Housing—It’s Your Right	405
	I.3 Federal Trade Commission, Equal Credit Opportunity	409
	I.4 Federal Reserve Board, Home Mortgages: Understanding Your Rights to Fair Lending	411
	Index	413
	Quick Reference to Consumer Credit and Sales Legal Practice Series.	435
	About the Companion CD-Rom	449

